رَفْعُ الْمَلَامَةِ عَنِ الْقِيَامِ عِنْدَ أَوَّلِ الْإِقَامَةِ

WHEN SHOULD THE MUQTADIS STAND UP FOR SALAAH IN JAMAAT?

Taken from: Jawaahirul Fiqh Volume 1

Written by: Hadhrat Mufti Mohammed Shafee' Saheb Uthmaani (Rahmatullaahi Alayh).

Translated by: Moulana Yusuf Laher

بِسْمِ اللهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِيْم

When should the Muqtadis stand up for Salaah in Jamaat? Should they stand before the Iqaamat begins, when the Iqaamat begins or when the words Hayya alal Falaah is reached?

The answer to this question lies in the practice of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) and the Noble Sahaabah (Radhiyallaahu Anhum).

THE PRACTICE OF RASULULLAH (SALLALLAAHU ALAYHI WA SALLAM)

صحيح مسلم - (ج 2 / ص 102) وَحَدَّثَنِى سَلَمَةُ بْنُ شَبِيبٍ حَدَّثَنَا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ أَعْيَنَ حَدَّثَنَا زُهَيْرُ حَدَّثَنَا سِماكُ بْنُ حَرْبٍ عَنْ جَابِرِ بْنِ سَمُرَةَ قَالَ كَانَ بِلاَلُ يُؤَذِّنُ إِذَا دَحَضَتْ فَلاَ يُقِيمُ حَتَّى يَخْرُجَ النَّبِيُّ -صلى الله عليه وسلم- فَإِذَا خَرَجَ أَقَامَ الصَّلاَةَ حِينَ يَرَاهُ.

1. Sayyidina Bilaal (Radhiyallaahu Anhu) would render the Thuhr Adhaan after Zawaal. He would not say the Iqaamat until Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) emerged from his quarters. When he emerged and he saw him, the Iqaamat would begin. (Muslim)

صحيح مسلم - (ج 2 / ص 101) وَحَدَّثَنِى إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ مُوسَى أَخْبَرَنَا الْوَلِيدُ بْنُ مُسْلِم عَنِ الأَوْزَاعِيِّ عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنِى أَبُو سَلَمَةَ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ أَنَّ الصَّلاَةَ كَانَتْ تُقَامُ لِرَسُولِ اللهِ آ –صلى الله عليه وسلم – فَيَأْخُذُ النَّاسُ مَصَافَّهُمْ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَقُومَ النَّبِيُّ –صلى الله عليه وسلم – مَقَامَةُ.

2. The people would stand for Salaah in preparation for the Imaamat of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam). The people would take their place in the Saffs before Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) stood up from his place. (Muslim)

صحيح مسلم - (ج 2 / ص 101) حَدَّثَنَا هَارُونُ بْنُ مَعْرُوفٍ وَحَرْمَلَةُ بْنُ يَحْيَى قَالاً حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ وَهْبٍ أَخْبَرَنِى يُونُسُ عَنِ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنِى أَبُو سَلَمَةَ بْنُ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ عَوْفٍ سَمِعَ أَبَا هُرَيْرَةَ يَقُولُ أُقِيمَتِ الصَّلاَةُ فَقُمْنَا فَعَدَّلْنَا الصُّفُوفَ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَخْرُجَ إِلَيْنَا رَسُولُ اللهِ حَليه وسلم 3. Sayyidina Abu Hurayrah (Radhiyallaahu Anhu) says that once they stood up for Salaah and straightened the Saffs even before Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) emerged from his quarters. (Muslim)

4. Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) told the Sahaabah: Do not stand for Salaah until you see me. (Bukhaari)

5. Ibni Shihaab narrates that the people would stand up for Salaah when the Muezzin would say Allaahu Akbar Allaahu

Akbar. The Saffs would be straightened before Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) reached his place (of Imaamat). (Musannaf Abdur Razzaaq)

مجمع الزوائد – (ج 2 / ص 272) عن عبد الله بن أبي أوفى قال : كان بلال إذا قال : قد قامت الصلاة نهض رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم بالتكبير

6. Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) would stand up from his place when Sayyidina Bilaal said: Qad Qaamatis Salaah. (Majma'uz Zawaa'id)

These are six narrations describing the practice of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam).

The first narration explains that the general habit of Sayyidina Bilaal (Radhiyallaahu Anhu) was to keep an eye on the quarters of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam). When he emerged from his quarters, Sayyidina Bilaal would commence the Iqaamat. Allaamah Zurqaani in his commentary of Mu'attaa Imam Maalik and Qaadhi Ayaadh in Sharh Shifaa have written the above-mentioned explanation.

The words of Allaamah Zurqaani:

شرح الزرقاني - (ج 1 / ص 214)

Sayyidina Bilaal would await the appearance of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam). As soon as he saw him, he would begin the Iqaamat; and this was even before most of the people saw him. The people would stand as they saw him. He would not stand in his position (of Imaamat) until the Saffs were straightened.

The second and third narrations substantiate that the Sahaabah Kiraam would usually stand up when the Iqaamat started and would begin straightening the Saffs.

Explaining the words 'straightening the Saffs' in the third narration, Imam Nawawi writes in the commentary of Muslim:

There is an indication (in the words 'straightening the Saffs') that they considered this a Sunnah. The Ulama are unanimous on the merits of straightening the Saffs. The fourth narration is indicative that at times Sayyidina Bilaal would commence with the Iqaamat even before Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) emerged from his quarters and the Sahaabah would stand up and prepare the Saffs when the Iqaamat started. Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) for some reason got delayed in emerging from his quarters so he advised them not to stand before he came out. Obviously this was to save the people from the inconvenience of waiting while standing for a long period of time.

The words 'do not stand until you see me' means that do not stand until I emerge from my quarters. It is also indicative that there is no harm in standing as soon as he emerged from his quarters.

The fifth narration explains the common routine; Sayyidina Bilaal would commence with the Iqaamat when he saw Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) emerging from his quarters and the people would stand up as soon as the Iqaamat commenced and begin straightening the Saffs.

The sixth narration makes clear that at times Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) would be present in the Masjid well before the commencement of Salaah. In this case he would stand up for the Salaah when the Muezzin said 'Qad qaamatis Salaah'. It seems that in this case the Sahaabah stood up when he stood up.

The common factor derived from these narrations is that when Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) was not present in the Masjid before hand but would come out from his quarters, Sayyidina Bilaal would commence with the Iqaamat as soon as he emerged from his quarters and the Sahaabah Kiraam would stand immediately on hearing the Iqaamat and straightened their Saffs and Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) never forbade this practice.

Yes, he did discourage them from commencing the Iqaamat and standing up before his appearance from his quarters and this was because of his consideration for them, and if done, it is termed 'Makrooh Tanzeehi' by the jurists (because of his discouragement).

PRACTICE OF THE KHULAFAA RAASHIDEEN

سنن أبى داود - (ج 1 / ص 250) حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ مُعَاذٍ حَدَّثَنَا خَالِدُ بْنُ الْحَارِثِ حَدَّثَنَا حَاتِمٌ - يَعْنِى ابْنَ أَبِى صَغِيرَةَ - عَنْ سِماكٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ النُّعْمانَ بْنَ بَشِيرٍ قَالَ كَانَ رَسُولُ اللهَ حسلى الله عليه وسلم - يُسَوِّى صُفُو فَنَا إِذَا قُمْنَا لِلصَّلاَةِ فَإِذَا اسْتَوَيَّنَا كَبَرَ.

Sayyidina Nu'maan ibni Basheer (Radhiyallaahu Anhu) narrates that Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) would straighten our Saffs when we stood up for Salaah and only said the Takbeer for Salaah after we were straight (in the Saffs). (Abu Dawood)

Sayyidina Umar (Radhiyallaahu Anhu) would appoint people to straighten the Saffs. He would not begin the Salaah until he was told that the Saffs were straight.

Imam Tirmidhi has recorded this narration and he has also written that this was also the practice of Sayyidina Ali and Sayyidina Uthmaan (Radhiyallaahu Anhumaa). (Naylul Awtaar) The first narration explains the method of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) and the second narration the method of Sayyidina Umar, Sayyidina Ali and Sayyidina Uthmaan (Radhiyallaahu Anhum). They would also themselves check on the Saffs and would not begin the Salaah until they were satisfied that the Saffs were straight, i.e. there were no gaps in-between the Saffs and all were in a straight line. They would not begin the Salaah until then.

This is possible when the people stand up for Salaah from the commencement of the Iqaamat, as mentioned in the narrations above that this was the usual procedure of the Sahaabah Kiraam. If they had stood when the Muezzin said Hayya alas Salaah or Hayya alal Falaah or Qad qaamatis Salaah, and thereafter the straightening of the Saffs took place, the Salaah would have been delayed for a long period after the completion of the Iqaamat, which is unanimously condemned by the Ulama.

RULINGS OF THE FUQAHAA

The Fuqahaa (jurists) have included this Mas'alah under the heading 'Aadaabus Salaah' i.e. Etiquette of Salaah. Aadaab are those factors that if a person leaves them out, he is not committing a Makrooh act nor is he worthy of reproach. Fulfilling the Aadaab is best but to reproach a person who fails to fulfil them is not permissible and in fact a Bid'ah. The following is recorded in Durre Mukhtaar:

الدر المختار – (ج 1 / ص 477) (ولـها آداب) تركه لا يوجب إساءة ولا عتابا كترك سنة الزوائد لكن فعله أفضل

The Salaah consists of a few Aadaab. No sin is incurred by leaving them out nor reproach, as when the Sunan Zawaa'id is neglected but to fulfil the Aadaab is virtuous. Regarding the views of the A'immah Mujtahideen, Imam Nawawi (Rahmatullaahi Alayh) writes in the commentary of Muslim:

شرح النووي على مسلم - (ج 5 / ص 103) فمذهب الشافعي رحمه الله تعالى وطائفة أنه يستحب أن لا يقوم أحد حتى يفرغ المؤذن من الاقامة ونقل القاضي عياض عن مالك

According to Imam Shaafi'ee (Rahmatullaahi Alayh) and a group of scholars, it is Mustahabb not to stand up until the Muezzin has completed the Iqaamat. Qaadhi Ayaadh has related from Imam Maalik (Rahmatullaahi Alayh) and from many Ulama that it is Mustahabb to stand up when the Muezzin commences the Iqaamat. Sayyidina Anas (Radhiyallaahu Anhu) would stand up when the Muezzin said 'Qad qaamatis Salaah' and Imam Ahmad (Rahmatullaahi Alayh) is of the same view. The view of Imam Abu Haneefah and the Ulama of Kufah is the people should stand when the Muezzin says 'Hayya alas Salaah'. (Sharh Muslim – Imam Nawawi)

The details of the Hanafi Madhab are recorded in Fataawa Aalamgiri (Al Hindiyyah) and in Badaai':

الفتاوى الهندية - (ج 1 / ص 57) إنْ كان الْـمُؤَذِّنُ غير الْإِمَامِ وكان الْقَوْمُ مع الْإِمَامِ في الْـمَسْجِدِ فإنه يَقُومُ الْإِمَامُ وَالْقَوْمُ إِذَا قال الْـمُؤَذِّنُ حَيَّ على الْفَلَاحِ عِنْدَ عُلَماًئِنَا

If the Muezzin and the Imam is not the same person and the Imam and Muqtadis are in the Masjid, the Imam and Muqtadis will stand when the Muezzin says 'Hayya alal Falaah', according to our 'three Ulama' (Imam Abu Haneefah, Imam Abu Yusuf, Imam Mohammed Rahmatullaahi Alayhim) and this is the correct view.

If the Imam is outside the Masjid and he enters from behind the Saffs, each Saff will stand when he passes that particular Saff. This is the opinion of Shamsul A'immah Al Halwaani, Al Sarakhsi and Shaykhul Islam Khwaahir Zaadah. If the Imam enters the Masjid from the front, the people will stand as soon as they see the Imam. They will not stand before he enters the Masjid. (Fataawa Aalamgiri). The following is recorded in Badaai':

بدائع الصنائع - (ج 1 / ص 200) لِأَنَّ الْقِيَامَ لِأَجْلِ الصَّلَاةِ وَلَا يُمْكِنُ أَدَاؤُهَا بِدُونِ الْإِمَامِ فلم يَكُنْ الْقِيَامُ مُفِيدًا ثُمَّ إِنْ دخل الْإِمَامُ من قُدَّامِ الصُّفُوفِ فكلما (فكما) رَأَوْهُ قَامُوا لِأَنَّهُ لـما (كلما) دخل الْمَسْجِدَ قام مَقَامَ الْإِمَامَةِ وَإِنْ دخل من وَرَاءِ الصُّفُوفِ فَالصَّحِيحُ أَنَّهُ كُلَّمَا جَاوَزَ صَفًا قام ذلك الصَّفُ لِأَنَّهُ صَارَ بِحَالٍ لو اقْتَدَوْا بِهِ جَازَ فَصَارَ فِي حَقِّهِمْ كَأَنَّهُ أخذ (أخذه) مَكَانَهُ ،

The Qiyaam (standing) is for the purpose of Salaah and Salaah (in Jamaat) is not possible without the Imam. Thus, standing (without the presence of the Imam) is not beneficial. If the Imam enters from the front of the Masjid, the people will stand as soon as they see him because when he enters he will directly proceed to the place of Imaamat. If he enters from the back of the Masjid (from behind the Saffs), the correct view is that each Saff will stand as he passes the particular Saff, for by his passing of each Saff it becomes valid for that Saff to follow him in Salaah. It is as if the Imam is already on his place (in front of them) for each Saff passed. (Badaai'us Sanaai')

Imam Maalik himself has expressed his view in his compilation 'Mu'attaa' in reply to a question:

Imam Maalik was asked when is it necessary for the people to stand for Salaah? He replied: I have not heard of any definite ruling regarding this, but I suppose that this is according to the strength of the people. For, among them are those who are heavy and those who are light-bodied. All of them are not the same (and cannot stand at the same time). (Mu'attaa Imam Maalik)

The views of the four Imams have been mentioned above. The summary is as follows: According to Imam Shaafi'ee it is Mustahabb to stand after the completion of the Iqaamat. According to the statement of Qaadhi Ayaadh, the view of Imam Maalik is it is Mustahabb to stand from the commencement of the Iqaamat. But according to the statement in Mu'attaa, there is no fixed ruling for this and people should stand up according to their ability, respectively. A heavy-bodied person takes longer to stand up compared to a light-bodied person. A sick person also takes longer to stand up. A lightbodied person can stand up quickly. The view of Imam Ahmad is to stand when the Muezzin says 'Qad qaamatis Salaah'. The details of the view of the Madhab of Imam Abu Haneefah is explained in Aalamgiri and Badaai' (above). If the Imam and Muqtadis are present in the Masjid, then according to the reliable narration, they should stand when the Muezzin says 'Hayya alal Falaah'. If the Imam is entering from outside then there are two scenarios: (a) if he is entering from the front of the Masjid, the Muqtadis will stand on seeing the Imam. (b) If the Imam enters from the back of the Masjid, each Saff will stand as he passes it.

NOTE: Where the Hanafi Madhab is explained in Al Bahrur Raa'iq that if the Imam and Muqtadis are present in the Masjid before time, the Imam and Muqtadis will stand when the Muezzin says Hayya alal Falaah, the following reason is furnished:

البحر الرائق - (ج 1 / ص 321) قَوْلُهُ (وَالْقِيَامُ حين قِيلَ حَيَّ على الْفَلَاحِ) لِأَنَّهُ أَمْرٌ بِهِ فَيُسْتَحَبُّ الْـُمُسَارَعَةُ إِلَيْهِ ،

It is better to stand up on the words of Hayya alal Falaah because these words carry an instruction (to come to success). Therefore on these words will a person make an effort and hasten (towards success). (Al Bahrur Raa'iq)

This implies that those who are of the opinion that it is Mustahabb to stand at Hayya alal Falaah and Qad qaamatis Salaah because of the instruction contained in it, consider it against etiquette to still be seated thereafter but do not consider standing up before these words to be against etiquette, because standing before these words are said is also hurrying (towards success) on a greater level.

Thus, those who consider it Mustahabb to stand at Hayya alas Salaah are not saying that to stand before it is contrary to Mustahabb, but to remain seated after those words is against etiquette, for this will be against hastening towards obedience.

After pondering it will be realised that the four Imams are unanimous on two aspects; (a) the differences of opinion is based on better and best and not a matter of impermissible and Makrooh. Thus, no one has the right to object or oppose anyone in this regard. The followers of the four Madhabs do not oppose each other in this matter. (b) The consensus of the Sahaabah, Taabi'een and unanimity of the four Imams proves that it is Waajib to straighten the Saffs which should be attained before the Salaah commences and this can be easily achieved when the people stand up at the commencement of the Iqaamat. According to Imam Maalik, there is no harm if the weak and the ill stand up a bit later.

The essence of this is as follows: When the Imam and Muqtadis are present in the Masjid before time, it is best to stand at Hayya alal Falaah and Qad Qaamatis Salaah according to Imam Abu Haneefah and Imam Ahmad ibni Hambal, and according to Imam Shaafi'ee after the Iqaamat is complete. According to Imam Maalik, at the beginning of the Iqaamat and the general practice of the Khulafaa Raashideen and most Sahaabah substantiate this view. Thus, the ruling of Hadhrat Sa'eed ibni Musayyab is that to stand up at the beginning of the Iqaamat is not only Mustahabb but Waajib. Not one of the four Imams have ruled that it is necessary for the Imam to first sit on the Musallaa, to reprimand those who are standing and to consider those standing as doing wrong. It is not the Madhab of any Imam to consider standing from the beginning as Makrooh or to or to think ill of or to insult such people.

The authentic views of the Hanafi Madhab has been mentioned in Aalamgiri and Badaai' which have been approved by Shamsul A'immah Sarakhsi and other Hanafi scholars. No one among the Hanafi scholars in their books, commentaries and Fatwa compilations have written that it is Makrooh to stand from the beginning except in the narration of Mudhmaraat which has been related by Tahtaawi. No one else has said that it is Makrooh, and how could they say so whereas standing from the beginning (of the Iqaamat) has been proven from Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam), the Khulafaa Raashideen, the other Sahaabah and Taabi'een.

As far as the narration of 'Mudhmaraat' is concerned, Tahtaawi has recorded it as follows:

If a person enters the Masjid when the Muezzin has begun the Iqaamat, the person will sit and will not wait while standing. (Tahtaawi)

This narration can clearly imply that the person will not wait while standing if the Iqaamat has begun before the Imam has entered the Masjid, which has been discouraged by Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) as mentioned earlier. The words 'do not wait' means not to wait for the Imam while standing. By taking this meaning of this narration, it now complies with the other narrations of the Hanafi Madhab and does not oppose the Sunnah of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam) and of the Sahaabah.

On the other hand, if it is interpreted that it is Makrooh for a person entering to stand while the Iqaamat is being said (but should first sit) and the Imam is present in the Masjid, then because it is contrary to the other texts and commentaries of the Hanafi Madhab, this narration will be ignored, because it is also contrary to the Sunnah and because the narration can be interpreted (to comply) as mentioned above.

Tahtaawi has interpreted the narration of Mudhmaraat in this manner which opposes the common texts and commentaries of the Hanafis and also the Sunnah of the Sahaabah in this regard. The greatness and knowledge of Allaamah Tahtaawi is in its place, but to interpret the narration in this manner is reason in itself to discard it.

In fact Allaamah Tahtaawi has recorded the same view as mentioned in Aalamgiri and Badaai' in his commentary on Durre Mukhtaar; if the Imam enters from the front of the Masjid, the people will stand on seeing him, and if he enters from the back, each Saff will stand as he passes it. It is recorded in Durre Mukhtaar that if the Imam himself also renders the Iqaamat, the people will not stand until the completion of the Iqaamat. Durre Mukhtaar narrates this with reference to 'Zaheeriyah'. Tahtaawi has written the following under this Mas'alah:

From this previous discussion, sometimes some people misunderstand it to mean that it is Makrooh to stand from the beginning. (Tahtaawi alad Durr)

The words ربما يؤاخذ used by Allaamah Tahtaawi shows that to believe it as Makrooh is not a weighty opinion and he did not say that this is his opinion but said that some people take this meaning from the text.

To sum up, among all the Hanafi texts on this discussion, the text of only Mudhmaraat is unclear and it can also be interpreted according to the views of the majority and the common texts of the Hanafi books. If the meaning of Makrooh is taken from it, then because it is contrary to the view of the Imams of the Madhab and texts and commentaries, it will be thrust aside.

SUMMARY

It has been elucidated that the practice of Rasulullah (Sallallaahu Alayhi wa Sallam), the Khulafaa Raashideen and the majority of the Sahaabah and Taabi'een was that when the Imam enters the Masjid people would stand from the beginning of the Iqaamat and straighten the Saffs.

If the Imam is present in the Masjid before time, it is Mustahabb to stand at 'Hayya alal Falaah', meaning that it is against etiquette to remain seated after these words because it will be against the instruction of 'hastening towards success' but not against etiquette to stand up before these words because it is 'hastening towards success' even earlier.

In some Masaajid there is a custom that at the time of Iqaamat the Imam emerges from one of the corners, considers it necessary to sit on the Musallaa first, instructs those standing to be seated and censures them, this is not the view of any Imam or jurist of this Ummat but is a pure innovation (Bid'ah).

NOTE: This purpose of this article is to clarify and explain this Mas'alah. Although the last method is contrary to the view of majority of the jurists and abominable, fighting and arguing over this issue is far worse. It is not appropriate to fight and argue over this issue. With affection and kindness, explain the Mas'alah to those whom there is hope that they will accept otherwise silence is better. Align your own actions according to the Sunnah and do not oppose others.

Allah Ta'aala knows best.