

Did Hazrat Umar (r.a) attack on Hazrat Fatima (r.a)'s house?

Q: Hazrat Umar (r.a) attacking Hazrat Fatima (r.a)'s house? What is the history behind it? What is the history behind it? Many people have mentioned this to me. is it true? This can be related in Sunni books such as Tibari (Volume II, page 443), Al-Imama Wa's-Siyasa, Volume I, page 13, Iqdu'l-Farid, Part III, page 63, Ibn Khaziba in his Kitab-e-Gharrar, Ibn Shahna in Hashiyya-e-Kamil of Ibn Athir Volume XI, page 112. Please help me refute these claims. Are the Isnaads for these narrations valid?

A: We do not possess the books which you have made reference to, therefore we do not know what they may contain regarding the topic "Umar attacking Fatima's house". Moreover we do not really know what you intend asking. Which incident are you referring to? If your question is regarding Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum)'s marriage to Umm-e-Kulthum, the daughter of Ali (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) and Fatima (R.A.), then you should understand that this marriage took place without any force or fight. An authentic book of the Shias named "Furoo-e-Kaafi", Vol. 5, Page 346, states that Umm-e-Kulthum was Ali (RadhiALLAHu Anhum)'s daughter. Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) proposed for her to Ali (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) during his (Umar's) Khilafat, who (Ali) authorized Abbas (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) to carry out the marriage contract. Abbas (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) did as he was told and had the two of them married publicly. This took place in Thil Qa'dah (11th Islamic month) 17 AH. Umm-e-Kulthum was 14 years old at that time. Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) went through with this marriage in order to acquire the privilege of being related to Nabi (SallALLAHo Alayhi Wasallam) after he heard the Prophet (SallALLAHo Alayhi Wasallam) saying that every relation whether it be direct or indirect will be of no benefit on the Day of Judgment except for the ones related to me. In this same happiness Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) fixed forty thousand dirhams as Mahar (dowry). Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) acquired a son named Zaid and a daughter Ruqayyah from this marriage.

Fatima (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) passed away in 11 AH. She was not alive at the time of Umm-e-Kulthum's marriage which leaves no meaning to Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum)'s attacking her house.

The people who say that Umar (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) attacked Fatima (RadhiALLAHu Anhum)'s house and forcefully married her daughter have come down to disgracing Ali (RadhiALLAHu Anhum) and the whole of Bani Hashim. Can such an act be possible in the blessed time of the Sahabah without Sahabi objecting to it? All these kinds of stories are fabricated. For more detail check the following books: "Hum Sunni Kyun Hain?" and "Shia Kay Hazar Sawal Ka Jawab." (Written by Maulana Mehr Muhammad Mianwalvi)

and Allah Ta'ala Knows Best

Mufti Muhammad Ashraf,
Dar-ul-Ifta,

Jamia Mahmoodia, Springs.

(JOINT PROJECT WITH DAR-UL-IFTA, MADRASSAH IN'AAMIYYAH, CAMPERDOWN, SOUTH AFRICA)